

APPENDIX 2
COMMENTS RECEIVED

Comments Summary:

BCAG received minor comments from Caltrans HQ. The email correspondence is included.

Regarding Air Quality Conformity, BCAG received concurrence from the Interagency Consultation Review Group.

Ivan Garcia

Subject: FW: Draft BCAG 2023 FTIP & BCAG ICR - Proposed Action for BCAG 2023 FTIP Conformity Determination

Attachments: 23 FTIP DRAFT Document.docx; FTIP Resolution 2022-23 04.pdf; 2023 FTIP Performance Measures Reporting Workbook 4.6.22.xlsx; BCAG CTIPS 230 Bus Rollout Page Replacement.pdf; Biggs CTIPS 235 2nd St Bike Ped Replacement Page.pdf; Butte County CTIPS 107 Wymann Bridge Page Replacement.pdf; Caltrans SHOPPP CTIPS 162 Replacement Page.pdf; Chico CTIPS 204 Bruce Rd Replacement Page'.pdf; Chico CTIPS 234 Esplanade Widening Replacement Page.pdf

From: Ivan Garcia
Sent: Tuesday, September 27, 2022 4:08 PM
To: Kahrs, Jacqueline J@DOT <jacqueline.kahrs@dot.ca.gov>
Subject: RE: Draft BCAG 2023 FTIP & BCAG ICR - Proposed Action for BCAG 2023 FTIP Conformity Determination

Hi Jackie....

Below is a summary of the corrective actions per your comments.

~~~~~  
Iván García  
Programming Director



326 Huss Drive, Suite 150  
Chico, CA 95928  
530-809-4603  
[igarcia@bcag.org](mailto:igarcia@bcag.org) [www.bcag.org](http://www.bcag.org)

---

**From:** Kahrs, Jacqueline J@DOT <[jacqueline.kahrs@dot.ca.gov](mailto:jacqueline.kahrs@dot.ca.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 6, 2022 3:36 PM  
**To:** Ivan Garcia <[IGarcia@bcag.org](mailto:IGarcia@bcag.org)>  
**Cc:** D3 FTIP@DOT <[D3.FTIP@dot.ca.gov](mailto:D3.FTIP@dot.ca.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Draft BCAG 2023 FTIP & BCAG ICR - Proposed Action for BCAG 2023 FTIP Conformity Determination

Hi Ivan,

I have completed my review of BCAG's Draft 2023 FTIP. Great job! I only had a few minor comments which are outlined below.

Thank you for the opportunity to review BCAG's Draft 2023 FTIP:  
<http://www.bcag.org/documents/planning/FTIPs/2023%20FTIP/Document/23-FTIP-DRAFT-Document.pdf>.

Below are the public comments provided by the Caltrans Division of Financial Programming. Please address each comment below and include these comments along with the responses to each comment in the final 2023 FTIP submittal.

General Comments:

- BCAG is commended for a detailed description of how the FTIP is designed to achieve progress of the federal transportation performance measures.
- Please include in the FTIP's financial plan an analysis of revenues dedicated for maintaining and operating the federal-aid system. Include the basis for calculation, address any anticipated shortfall in available revenues, and describe plans to address the gap. It appears there is no anticipated shortfall in transit revenues.

**Action/Response: Page 28 identifies the operating and maintenance costs by jurisdiction. The source of data is what was compiled utilizing the State Controllers reports as reported by the local jurisdictions.**

- On page 43, please confirm if the following statement should refer to the 2023 FTIP period: "CMAQ – Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Program – Caltrans provided BCAG with estimated apportionments for the 2021 FTIP period."

**Action/Response: Sentence was revised to read: CMAQ – Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Program – Caltrans provides BCAG with estimated apportionments for the FTIPs. Revenues are estimated at:**

Project Specific Comments:

**ACTION / RESPONSE: All RTP/SCS REFERENCES HAVE BEEN DONE IN CTIPS:**

CTIPS ID# 20200000162: In CTIPS, please update the RTP reference to the 2020 RTP/SCS.

CTIPS ID# 20200000204: In CTIPS, please update the RTP reference to the 2020 RTP/SCS.

CTIPS ID# 10200000234: In CTIPS, please include a reference where this project can be found in the RTP.

CTIPS ID# 10200000235: In CTIPS, please include a reference where this project can be found in the RTP.

CTIPS ID# 10200000230: In CTIPS, please include a reference where this project can be found in the RTP.

CTIPS ID# 20200000107: In CTIPS, please update the RTP reference to the 2020 RTP/SCS.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns.

Thank you,

Jacqueline Kahrs  
Office of Federal Programming and Data Management  
Division of Financial Programming  
California Department of Transportation  
(916) 215-3382 (cell)  
[jacqueline.kahrs@dot.ca.gov](mailto:jacqueline.kahrs@dot.ca.gov)